

May 16, 2011

# **Via E-Docket Filing**

Dr. Burl W. Haar Executive Secretary Minnesota Public Utilities Commission 350 Metro Square 121 Seventh Place East St. Paul, MN 55101

RE: In the Matter of the Application of AWA Goodhue, LLC for a Site Permit for a 78 MW Large Wind Energy Conversion System in Goodhue County

Docket Nos. IP-6701/WS-08-1233

Dear Dr. Haar:

Enclosed please find AWA Goodhue, LLC's Exceptions to the ALJ's Findings of Fact, Conclusions, and Recommendations that were e-filed today in the above mentioned docket.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

/s/ Todd J. Guerrero

Todd J. Guerrero

Attorney

Direct Dial: 612.492.7370 Email: tguerrero@fredlaw.com

c: Service List (w/encl.)

Attorneys & Advisors main 612.492.7000 fax 612.492.7077 www.fredlaw.com

Fredrikson & Byron, P.A. 200 South Sixth Street, Suite 4000 Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402-1425

# STATE OF MINNESOTA BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Ellen Anderson David C. Boyd J. Dennis O'Brien Phyllis Reha Betsy L. Wergin Chair Commissioner

Commissioner Commissioner Commissioner

In the Matter of the Application of AWA Goodhue, LLC for a Site Permit for a 78 MW Wind Project and Associated Facilities in Goodhue County

Docket No. IP6701/WS-08-1233

AWA Goodhue's Exceptions to the ALJ's Findings of Fact, Conclusions and Recommendations

## I. INTRODUCTION

AWA Goodhue, LLC ("AWA Goodhue" or the "Applicant") agrees with, and recommends that the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission ("Commission") adopt, the Administrative Law Judge's ("ALJ") comprehensive Findings of Fact, Conclusions and Recommendations filed on April 29, 2011 in the above-referenced docket ("ALJ Recommendations"), subject to the two minor exceptions discussed below.

#### II. DISCUSSION

## A. Role of National Wind, LLC

In Finding #10, the ALJ describes the ownership structure of AWA Goodhue. The finding states in part, "[t]he Applicant owns National Wind, LLC, a development company headquartered in Minneapolis." The Applicant excepts to this finding because there is no ownership affiliation between AWA Goodhue and National Wind. Rather, AWA Goodhue has contracted with National Wind for local development services. As such, National Wind serves

Ex. 1, Ward Direct at 4.

as the project's primary developer.<sup>2</sup> AWA Goodhue requests that the Commission correct Finding #10 in its final order as follows:

10. The Applicant ewns has contracted with National Wind, LLC, a development company headquartered in Minneapolis, to provide development services for the project.<sup>3</sup> American Wind Alliance, LLC, owns the Applicant; Mesa Power Group owns American Wind Alliance; and Thomas Boone Pickens, Jr., owns Mesa Power Group. Upon commercial operation, the Applicant will be owned jointly by American Wind Alliance (99%) and Ventem Energy, LLC, a group of about 20 Minnesota investors (one percent).<sup>4</sup>

# B. Date of Applicant's Noise Study

Finding #71 should be corrected to reflect the date of the Applicant's updated noise modeling study. AWA Goodhue hired HDR to conduct noise modeling to determine the maximum expected sound level at all residences within the project area from the cumulative effect of the proposed turbines.<sup>5</sup> As part of HDR's work, HDR conducted a noise study that included measuring the existing noise levels within the site.<sup>6</sup> HDR measured existing sound levels within the site in June 2010.<sup>7</sup>

In addition, HDR used the Cadna-A computer model to perform an analysis of the expected cumulative sound levels from all proposed turbines within the site. HDR originally prepared a report summarizing both its background noise measurement study and its Cadna-A modeling in July 2010, in advance of the public hearing conducted by ALJ Eric Lipman. HDR refreshed its Cadna-A modeling of the projected cumulative sound levels again prior to submitting direct testimony in the administrative hearing conducted by ALJ Sheehy. The results of HDR's January 2011 study of the cumulative sound levels were

Ex. 3, Burdick Direct at 1.

Ex. 1, Ward Direct at 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ex. 1, Ward Direct at 4; Tr. 2:68-69 (Ward).

Ex. 3, Burdick Direct at 15.

Ex. 6, Casey Direct at 2.

Ex. 6, Casey Direct, Attachment A at 7.

Ex. 6, Casey Direct at 2.

Ex. 6, Casey Direct, Attachment A at 1.

included in Attachment A to the Direct Testimony of Mr. Tim Casey. 10 Therefore, AWA

Goodhue requests that Finding #71 be corrected as follows:

71. Based on the manufacturer's specifications for the turbines proposed for use in this project, a setback of 750 feet for one turbine would meet MPCA noise

standards. In this case, because multiple turbines could potentially impact a residence, the Applicant conducted a sound modeling study in June 2010 January

2011 to determine the maximum sound level from the cumulative effect of all

proposed turbines.

III. **CONCLUSION** 

Applicant respectfully requests that the Commission adopt the ALJ Recommendations

in its entirety, with the exception of the minor modifications described above. In addition, the

Applicant requests that the Commission adopt the proposed findings of fact recommended by

the Department of Commerce, Division of Energy Resources ("DOC") on October 13, 2010.

updated as necessary to be consistent with the ALJ's Recommendations. Finally, the Applicant

respectfully requests that the Commission issue a site permit to AWA Goodhue containing

conditions substantially similar to those proposed by the DOC on October 13, 2010.

Dated: May 16, 2011

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Todd J. Guerrero

Todd J. Guerrero (#0238478)

Christina K. Brusven (#0388226)

FREDRIKSON & BYRON, P.A.

200 South Sixth Street, Suite 4000

Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402-1425

Telephone: (612) 492-7000

Fax: (612) 492-7077

Attorneys for AWA Goodhue, LLC

4927034

10 Ex. 6, Casey Direct, Attachment A.

3

# **AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE**

In the Matter of the Application of AWA Goodhue, LLC for a Site Permit for a 78 MW Large Wind Energy Conversion System in Goodhue County

MPUC Docket No. IP-6701/WS-08-1233 OAH Docket No. 3-2500-21662-2

STATE OF MINNESOTA ) ss. COUNTY OF HENNEPIN )

Kristen Swenson, of the City of Minneapolis, County of Hennepin, in the State of Minnesota, being duly sworn, says that on the 16<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2011, she e-filed with the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission the following:

- (1) AWA Goodhue's Exceptions to the ALJ's Findings of Fact, Conclusions and Recommendations; and
- (2) Affidavit of Service.

A copy has also been served via electronic mail or U.S. Mail in accordance with the service list of record.

Kristen Swenson

Subscribed and sworn to before me on May 16, 2011.

Notary Public



First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Julia	Anderson	Julia.Anderson@state.mn.u Office of the Attorney s General-DOC		IM Tower 5 Minnesota St . Paul, N	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Stephen	Betcher	Steve.Betcher@co.goodhu County of Goodhue e.mn.us		Goodhue County Justice Center 454 West Sixth Street Red Wing, Minnesota 55066	Electronic Service	ON	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Christina	Brusven	cbrusven@fredlaw.com	Fredrikson & Byron, P.A.	200 S 6th St Ste 4000 Minneapolis, MN 554021425	Electronic Service	No.	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Bob	Cupit	bob.cupit@state.mn.us	Public Utilities Commission	Suite 350 121 7th Place East St. Paul, MN 551012198	Electronic Service	No	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Patricia	DeBleeckere	tricia.debleeckere@state.m n.us	Public Utilities Commission	Suite 350 121 Seventh Place East St. Paul, MN 55101	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1-
Sharon	Ferguson	sharon.ferguson@state.mn .us	Department of Commerce	85 7th Place E Ste 500 Saint Paul, MN 551012198	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Todd J.	Guerrero	tguerrero@fredlaw.com	Fredrikson & Byron, P.A.	jee.	Electronic Service	ON.	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Burt W.	Haar	burl.haar@state.mn.us	Public Utilities Commission Suite 350 121 7th Place East St. Paul, MN 551012147		Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Karen Finstad	Hammel	Karen.Hammel@state.mn. us	Office of the Attorney General-DOC	1400 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota Street St. Paul, MN 551012131	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Patrick	Hynes	phynes@strobelhanson.co m	Strobel & Hanson, P.A.	406 W Third Street Suite 200 Red Wing, MN 55066	Electronic Service	OZ.	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233

First Name	Last Name	Email	Company Name	Address	Delivery Method	View Trade Secret	Service List Name
Jack	Levi		Goodhue Wind LLC	Suite 525 3033 Excelsior Blvd. Minneapolis, MN 55416	Paper Service	No	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
John	Lindell	agorud.ecf@state.mn.us	Office of the Attorney General-RUD	900 BRM Tower 445 Minnesota St St. Paul, MN 551012130	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Carol	Overland	overland@legalectric.org	Legalectric, Inc.	P.O. Box 176 Red Wing, MN 55066	Paper Service	<sub>S</sub>	OFF SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Laura	Schlatter	Laura.Schlatter@state.mn. us	Office of Administrative Hearings	P.O. 64620 Saint Paul, MN 55164	Paper Service	Yes	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Daniel	Schleck	dschleck@mansfieldtanick. Mansfield, Tanick and Com		220 South Sixth Street Suite 1700 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Paper Service	ON	OFF SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Kathleen D.	Sheehy	kathleen.sheehy@state.mn   Office of Administrative .us		PO Box 64620 St. Paul, MN 551640620	Electronic Service	Yes	OFF SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233
Leon	Steinberg	N/A	Goodhue Wind, LLC	3033 Excelsior Boulevard Suite 525 Minneapolis, MN 55416	Paper Service	No V	OFF_SL_8-1233_CC-SL1- 08-1233